



Cases on Evidence

(1989-90 Edition)

Volume II

(pp. 462-1079)

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence
Course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of
the University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY

JAN 9 1990

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Cases on Evidence


(1989-90 Edition)

Volume II

(pp. 462-1079)

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence
Course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of
the University of Toronto



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/casesonevidence02mewe>

T A B L E O F C O N T E N T S

<u>Statutes</u>	<u>Page No.</u>
Charter of Rights	1
Canada Evidence Act	3
Evidence Act of Ontario	17
Chapter 1	33
Chapter 2	70
 1. <u>Introduction</u>	
Batary v. A.G. Sask., [1965] S.C.R. 465	118
Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C. (2d) 318	122
Pappajohn (1980), 14 C.R. (3d) 243	123
R. v. Whyte (1988), 42 C.C.C. (3d) 97	128
Oakes (1983), 2 C.C.C. (3d) 339	143
Holmes v. The Queen (1988), 41 C.C.C. (3d) 497	163
Morin v. R. (1989), 44 C.C.C. (3d) 193	180
Cloutier v. R. (1980), 48 C.C.C. (2d) 1	201
Morris (1984), 36, 36 C.R. (3d) 1	207
 2. <u>Competence, Compellability and Oaths</u>	
Gosselin (1907), 7 C.C.C. 139	219
McConnell and Beer, [1968] S.C.R. 802	223
Vezeau, [1977] 2 S.C.R. 277	227
Hoskyn v. M.P.C., [1978] 2 W.L.R. 695	229
Bowles (1967), 50 C.R. 353	231
Sillars (1980), 12 C.R. (3d) 202	233
R. v. Czipps (1980), 12 C.R. (3d) 193	235
McLaughlin (1974), 24 C.R.N.S. 362	239
R. v. Walsh (1979), 45 C.C.C. (2d) 199	243
R. v. Gunewardene, [1951] 2 K.B. 600	248
Toohey v. M.P.C., [1965] A.C. 595	250
Regina v. Hawke (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 1	254
Sankey v. The King (1927), 48 C.C.C. 97	259
R. v. Budin (1981), 58 C.C.C. (2d) 352	
(Ont. C.A.)	262
Kendall v. The Queen, [1962] S.C.R. 469	264
 3. <u>Refreshing Memory</u>	
McInroy and Rouse (1977), 5 C.R. (3d) 125	266
Regina v. Davey (1969), 6 C.R.N.S. 288	270

4. Credibility

(a) Expert Evidence

Wilband v. The Queen, [1967] 2 C.C.C. 6	274
Regina v. Rosik (1971), 13 C.R.N.S. 129	276
Regina v. Abbey (1982), 43 N.R. 30	286
Béland v. R. (1988), 60 C.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.)	294

(b) Enhancing Credibility

R. v. Clark (1984), 40 C.R. (3d) 183	311
Regina v. Kyselka, [1962] O.W.N. 164	318
Corke v. Corke, [1958] 1 All E.R. 224	320
Welstead v. Brown, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 3	322
Regina v. Rozich (1980), 10 C.R. (3d) 364	325
Regina v. Giraldi (1975), 28 C.C.C. (2d) 248	329
Regina v. Pangilinan (1988), 60 C.R. (3d) 188.	332

(c) Complaints in Sexual Cases

Sexual Offences Act	334
Timm v. The Queen (1981), 59 C.C.C. (2d) 396 (S.C.C.)	335
R. v. Page (1984), 40 C.R. (3d) 85	339

(d) Prior Inconsistent Statements

Deacon (1947), S.C.R. 531	345
McInroy and Rouse, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 588	347
Wawanesa v. Hanes, [1961] O.R. 495	353
Regina v. Milgaard (1971), 14 C.R.N.S. 34	357

(e) Prior Convictions

Criminal Code s. 593	362
D'Aoust (1902), 5 C.C.C. 407	362
Koufis v. The King (1941), S.C.R. 481	363
Regina v. St. Pierre (1974), 17 C.C.C. (2d) 489	365
Morris v. The Queen (1979), 43 C.C.C. (2d) 129	368
Regina v. Speid (1988), 42 C.C.C. (3d) 12	380
Corbett v. The Queen (1988), 41 C.C.C. (3d) 385	395

(f) Prior Sexual Conduct

Criminal Code ss. 246.6, 246.7 433

(g) Accused Attaching Own Credibility

Regina v. French (1978), 37 C.C.C. (2d) 201 434
 Helpard v. R. (1979), 10 C.R. (3d) 76 439
 Regina v. Dietrich (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 129 442
 Regina v. K. (1979), 47 C.C.C. (2d) 436 448

5. Character

Regina v. McNamara (1981) 56 C.C.C. (2d) 193 454
 Guay v. The Queen (1978), 42 C.C.C. (2d) 536 462
 Regina v. Taylor (1982), 35 O.R. (2d)
 738 (Ont. C.A.) 464
 Regina v. Glynn (1971), 15 C.R.N.S. 343 466
 Regina v. Lupien (1970), 9 C.R. 165 467
 Regina v. Lowery, [1973] 3 W.L.R. 235 472
 Regina v. McMillan (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 191 477
 Regina v. Robertson (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 141 482

6. Similar Fact Evidence

Criminal Code Section 312, 314(1)(b), 317, 318 484
 Makin & The Attorney General for New South
 Wales [1894] A.C. 57 485
 Regina v. Smith (1916), 11 Cr. Ap. Rep. 229 488
 Sweitzer v. The Queen (1982), 68 C.C.C. (2d) 193 489
 Director of Public Prosecutions & Boardman,
 [1975] A.C. 421 493
 Leblanc v. The Queen (1975), 29 C.C.C. (2d) 97 497
 Regina v. Straffen, [1952] 2 Q.B. 911 502
 Regina v. Scopelliti (1982), 63 C.C.C. (2d) 481 505
 Hoffman article, (1975), 91 L.Q.R. 193 512

7. Hearsay

(i) General

Myers v. D.P.P., [1965] A.C. 1001 521
 Ares v. Venner, [1970] S.C.R. 608 526
 Subramaniam, [1956] 1 W.L.R. 965 528
 Wright v. Tatham (1837), 112 E.R. 488 530
 Wysochan (1930), 54 C.C.C. 172 533
 Wildman (1984), 14 C.C.C. (3d) 321 535
 Ratten, [1972] A.C. 378 545

R. v. McKinnon 1989 70 C.R. (3d) 9 549

(ii) Res Gestae

Bedingfield (1879), 14 Cox C.C. 341 555
 Gilbert (1907), 38 S.C.R. 284 557
 Regina v. Hodd (1970), 1 C.C.C. (3d) 363 560
 Regina v. Graham (1972), 7 C.C.C. (2d) 93 564
 Regina v. Newton (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 161 569
 Regina v. Risby (1977), 32 C.C.C. (2d) 242 571
 Regina v. Keeler (1978), 36 C.C.C. (2d) 8 572
 Regina v. Clark (1983), 35 C.R. (3d) 357 575

(iii) Statements Against Interest

Donnelly v. U.S. (1913), 228 U.S. 243 591
 Regina v. O'Brien (1977), 35 C.C.C. (2d) 209 593
 Regina v. Pelletier (1978), 38 C.C.C. (2d) 515 596
 Lucier v. The Queen (1982), 65 C.C.C. (2d) 150 598

(iv) Prior Proceedings

Criminal Code S.S. 643, 541 600
 Walkerton v. Erdman (1894), 23 S.C.R. 352 601
 Hollington v. Hewthorn (1943), 1 K.B. 587 604
 Goody v. Odhams Press, [1967] 1 Q.B. 333 608
 Gushue v. The Queen (1980), 50 C.C.C. (2d) 417 608
 Grdic v. R. (1975), 19 C.C.C. (2d) 289 613
 English v. Richmond, [1956] S.C.R. 383 621
 Director of Public Prosecutions v. Humphrys,
 [1976] 2 All E.R. 497 624
 R. v. Prince (1987), 30 C.C.C. (3d) 35 626
 Kienapple v. The Queen (1974), 15 C.C.C.
 (2d) 524 634

(v) Bodily and Mental Condition

Youlden v. London Guarantee & Accident Co.
 (1912), 260 L.R. 75 636
 Mutual Life v. Hillmon (1892), 145 U.S. 285 638
 Regina v. Wainwright (1875), 13 Cox C.C. 171 640
 Rex v. Thomson, [1912] 3 K.B. 19 641
 Home v. Corbeil, [1955] 4 D.L.R. 750 642
 R. v. Blastland [1986] A.C. 41 644

(vi) Business Records

Regina v. Vanlergerghe (1979), 6 C.R. (3d) 222 654
 Regina v. McMullen (1979), 47 C.C.C. (2d) 499 655

Civil Evidence Act (U.K.); Computer Evidence (S. Africa)	661
Wood (1983), 76 Cr. App. R. 23	662

8. Confessions and Pre-Trial Statements

(i) General

Piché v. The Queen (1971), S.C.R. 23	665
--------------------------------------	-----

(ii) Persons in Authority

Regina v. Towler (1968), 5 C.R.N.S. 55	668
Regina v. Pettipiece (1972), 18 C.R.N.S. 236	669
Rothman v. The Queen (1981), 1 S.C.R. 640	673
Regina v. Collins (1976), 29 C.C.C. (2d) 304	676
Perras v. The Queen (1973), 11 C.C.C. (2d) 245	678
Regina v. Stewart (1989), 54 C.C.C. (2d) 93	680
Regina v. Lerke (1986), 24 C.C.C. (3d) 129	

(iii) The Voir Dire

Thiffault v. The King (1933), 60 C.C.C. 97	691
--	-----

(iv) Need for Voir Dire

Powell (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 323	694
Erven (1979), 6 C.R. (3d) 97	696
Price (1981) 59 C.C.C. (2d) 367 (Ont. Co. Ct.)	707
Park (1981), 59 C.C.C. (2d) 385 (S.C.C.)	709

(v) Timing of the Voir Dire

Regina v. Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C. (2d) 318	713
--	-----

(vi) Voluntariness

Ibrahim v. The King, [1941] A.C. 599	714
Horvath v. The Queen (1979), 44 C.C.C. (2d) 385	717
Ward v. R. (1979), 7 C.R. (3d) 153	725
R. v. Rothman (1981), 35 N.R. 485	728
R. v. Emile (1988), 42 C.C.C. (3d) 408	741
R. v. Woolley (1988), 40 C.C.C. (3d) 193	752
Baig v. The Queen (1988), 37 C.C.C. (3d) 193	759
Regina v. Logan et al. (1989), 43 C.C.C. (3d) 567	761

(vii) Charter Cases

Clarkson v. R (1988) 50 C.R. (3d) 289	784
R. Manninen (1987) 34 C.C.C. (3d) 385	790

(viii) Truth of Confession

R. v. Hammond, [1941] 3 All E.R. 318	796
R. v. Hnedish (1958), 26 W.W.R. 685	798
R. v. De Clerq, [1968] S.C.R. 902	800
R. v. Wong Kam-Ming, [1979] 2 W.L.R. 81	804

(ix) Confessions Confirmed by Subsequent Facts

R. v. St. Lawrence (1949), 93 C.C.C. 376	809
R. v. Wray (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 235	812

(x) Use of Confessions

R. v. Jackson (1980), 57 C.C.C. (2d) 154	819
R. v. Herodotou & Boulougouris (1979), 6 C.R. (3d) 336	824
R. v. Ma, Ho & Lai (1979), 6 C.R. (3d) 325	828

(xi) Use of Voir Dire Evidence at Trial

R. v. Van Dongen (1975), 31 C.R.N.S.	832
R. v. Magdish, Bennett & Sweet (1978 41 C.C.C. (2d) 392	837
R. v. Brophy (1981), 2 All E.R. 705	838
R. v. Tarrant (1982), 63 C.C.C. (2d) 385	841

(xii) Adopted Statements and Silence

Chapdelaine v. The King (1935, 63 C.C.C. 5	843
Regina v. Eden, [1970] 3 C.C.C. 280	844
R. v. Sweeney (No. 2) (1977), 35 C.C.C. (2d) 245	846
R. v. Christie, [1914] A.C. 545	849
R. v. Sayegh (No. 3) (1982), 69 C.C.C. (2d) 84	851

(xiii) Consciousness of Guilt and Lies

R. v. Burdick (1975) 27 C.C.C. (2d) 497	854
Sparrow v. R. (1979), 12 C.R. (3d) 158	857

(xiv) Conditional Admissibility

R. v. Carter (1982), 67 C.C.C. (2d) 568	859
---	-----

(xv) Guilty Plea

R. v. Dietrich (1970) 11 C.R.N.S. 22	861
R. v. Pentiluk & MacDonald (1975), 28 C.R.N.S. 324	864

(xvi) Young Offenders Act

R. v. J.J. (1989), 43 C.C.C. (3d) 257	867
---------------------------------------	-----

9. Admissions

Yorkton v. Morley (1967), 66 D.L.R. (2d) 37	873
Strand Electric Ltd. [1969] 2 C.C.C. 264	875

10. Privilege

Slavutych v. Baker (1977), 38 C.R.N.S. 306	877
Descoteaux v. Mierzewski, (1982), 44 N.R. 462	881
Shenton v. Tyler [1939] 1 Ch. 620	885
Rumping v. Director of Public Prosecutions	887
Regina v. St-Jean (1976), 34 C.R.N.S.	889
R. v. Akey and Akey, (1980), 12 C.R. (3d) 240	891
R. v. Jean and Piesinger, 7 C.R. (3d) 333; (1980) 16 C.R. (3d) 193	894
Lloyd and Lloyd v. The Queen, 64 C.C.C. (2d) 169	896
Reference re Legislative Privilege (1978), 39 C.C.C. (2d) 222	898
Solicitor General v. Royal Commission (1982), 62 C.C.C. (3d) 513	902
Dubois v. R. (1986) 22 C.C.C. (3d) 513	906

11. State Secrets

Duncan v. Cammell, Laird, [1942] A.C. 624	915
Conway v. Rimmer, [1963] A.C. 910	918
Mannix (1982), 126 D.L.R. (3d) 155	923
Re Goguen (1982) 10 C.C.C. (3d) 492	926
Carey v. The Queen (1987), 30 C.C.C. (3d) 498	938

12. Illegally Obtained Evidence

Kuruma [1955], A.C. 197	950
Sang [1980], A.C. 402	962
Lawrie v. Muir [1950], S.L.T. 37	966
Bunning v. Cross (1978), 52 A.L.J.R. 561	967
Criminal Code Sections 189, 193	968

Das (1979), 47 C.C.C. (2d) 194 970

12a. Charter Cases

Hunter v. Southam, (1984) 14 C.C.C. (3d) 97 972
Collins, (1987) 33 C.C.C. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.) 982
Therens, (1985) 45 C.R. (3d) 97 992
Strachan, (1989), 46 C.C.C. (3d) 479 1010

13. Corroboration

Criminal Code Section 274 1022
Baskerville, [1916] 2 K.B. 658 1022
Ethier, [1959] O.R. 533 1024
Warkentin (1976), 30 C.C.C. (2d) 1 1027
Vetrovec (1982), 67 C.C.C. (2d) 1 1031
Paquette v. Chubb (1989), 65 O.R. (2d) 321 1040

14. Real Evidence

Yachuk v. Blais, [1944] O.W.N. 412 1050
Draper v. Jacklyn, [1968] 2 O.R. 683 1051

15. Judicial Notice

Varcoe v. Lee, [1944] O.W.N. 412 1054

16. Miscellaneous Problems in the Trial Process

Cooper, (1977) 34 C.C.C. (2d) 18 1058
LeMay, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 232 1064
Browne v. Dunn, (1893) 6 R. 67 1068
Dyck, [1970] 2 C.C.C. 283 1070
Mate, (1973) 22 C.R.N.S. 387 1071
Angelantoni, (1975) 31 C.R.N.S. 342 1074
Dobberthien, (1973), 13 C.C.C. (2d) 513 1075
Sparre, (1978) 37 C.C.C. (2d) 495 1079